

The Current Status of English as a Foreign Language (EFL) Teachers' Professional Development in Turkey: A Systematic Review of Literature

Rabia Hos¹ and Hatice Topal²

*Zirve University, Faculty of Education, Department of English Language Teaching,
Kizilhisar Campus, Sahinbey, Gaziantep, Turkey*
Telephone: 90-342-211-6666 Ext. 6986
E-mail: ¹<rabia.hos@zirve.edu.tr>, ²<hatice.topal@zirve.edu.tr>

KEYWORDS English as a Foreign Language, Professional Development, In-service Education and Training

ABSTRACT With the globalization of the English language as a communication tool and the increased use of technology, the characteristics of learners and teachers are changing. In order to meet the demands of the learners, teachers must keep up-to-date and improve their teaching practices and beliefs, which necessitates professional development (PD) and in-service training for English as foreign Language (EFL) teachers. The purpose of this systematic review was to review the research studies that had been conducted in the area of EFL Teachers' Professional Development (PD) in Turkey. This meta-analysis reviewed the literature on professional development and in-service training of EFL teachers in journal articles, thesis and dissertations published between 2000 and 2012. A systematic review of literature was performed to examine the current status of EFL Teachers' professional development. Through the systematic review the methods and results of different research studies were analyzed through a collection of systematic techniques. The results of the study indicate that two broad terminologies has been used in the research literature, many of the studies were evaluative in nature and almost all of them were conducted at English Preparatory Schools at universities. Although the studies had provided many recommendations for professional development, there have been only a handful of studies that examined the impact of PD programs. Through the systematic review, the authors provided recommendations for future researchers and policy-makers.

INTRODUCTION

English has been increasingly growing as a global and dominant language worldwide (Nunan 2001). Parallel to its growth many countries place a great emphasis on the teaching of English. Many countries including Turkey have revised its language teaching policies to meet these demands (OECD 2005). Although there have been numerous reforms to improve the teaching of English as a foreign language, there are many systematic and pedagogical issues to resolve. According to EF English Proficiency Index (EPI) 2012, Turkey ranks 32nd country out of 54 countries based on English language competency. It is evident from this report that despite the educational reforms enacted, learners are not able to reach expected proficiency levels in English Language. There may be many factors contributing to this, including insufficient number of qualified teachers, frequent changes in the curricula, inadequate resources, lack of continued professional development opportunities and many more.

With the increasing expansion of technology and resources that are available at the finger-

tips of today's learners, the demands and needs also change. In order to meet the changing demands of learners it is of utmost importance that teachers renew their knowledge, beliefs and practices in their fields, which is only possible through continued professional training and development. Although a great emphasis is given to the development of English as Foreign Language (EFL) teachers in other countries, there have been very minimal opportunities for EFL teachers' training and development in Turkey. For example, between the years of 1998 and 2005, out of 3201 in-service education and training (INSET) programs offered by the Turkish Ministry of National Education, 122 of them were for EFL teachers (Kucuksuleymanoglu 2006). These numbers are also evident locally. From the INSET programs offered through the local ministry of national education, there have not been any opportunities for EFL teachers in this southeastern city. It is obvious that teachers are not provided with tools to equip themselves with professionalism.

Professionalism has been referred with various terminology including 'teacher development', 'professional development', 'professional

learning', 'professional learning community', 'training', and 'in-service training'. For the purposes of this systematic review, the focus will be INSET and professional development (PD) of EFL teachers in Turkey. Glatthorn (1995) defines professional development as "the professional growth a teacher achieves as a result of gaining increased experience and examining his or her teaching systematically" (p. 41). On the other hand, INSET refers to the educational and training activities that are engaged by teachers, which are often offered by an outside source such as the ministry of education (Gardner 1995).

The terms PD and INSET have been distinguished in the literature. While training has a focus on short-term and immediate goals, development focuses on the long-term growth of teachers (Richards and Farrell 2005). Although the two terms has been distinguished in the literature, they overlap. In order to professionally develop themselves, teachers need to engage in activities that lead to fulfillment of both short and long-term goals.

As a step forward to understanding the current status of INSET and PD of EFL teachers in Turkey, this systematic review of literature is very timely. The aim of this systematic review is:

1. To determine the previously conducted research articles, thesis and dissertations about PD or INSETs of EFL teachers in Turkey
2. To review and discuss the impact and implications of the previously conducted research.
3. To offer recommendations and suggestions for future research in this area.

METHODOLOGY

In order to be included in this systematic review of literature, the studies had to meet the following criteria:

1. Be published between 2000-2012 in a refereed Journal or SSCI and in the thesis and dissertation database of Turkish Higher Education Council (YOK).
2. Include participants from Institutions in Turkey.
3. Include EFL teachers' professional development or INSET.
4. Must be an empirical research.
5. Be published online.

6. Be published in English.

In order to identify the studies to be used in this review, several online databases were searched. The search was conducted through using the ERIC (Education Resources Information Center), ISI Web of Knowledge, CSA Linguistics and Language Behavior Abstracts (LLBA), Google Scholar and thesis and dissertation database of Turkish Higher Education Council (YOK). For EFL Teachers' Professional Development in Turkey, *professional development*, *in-service training*, *English Language Teachers*, *Turkey* search terms were used. The search function was created by using three Boolean operators: professional development or in-service training and EFL Teachers and Turkey. The search was performed by using the 'keyword' function.

All databases were searched for the period of 2000 to 2012 (January 2, 2013). The search resulted in 28 ERIC documents, 11 ISI Web of Knowledge documents, 41 LLBA documents, 23 Google Scholar documents, 75 YOK theses and dissertations. 217 total number of documents were found and examined preliminarily. Through the initial scanning the exclusion criteria was applied. All documents that included PD or INSET of general education or non-ELT fields, pre-service teachers', settings other than Turkey, and non-empirical studies were eliminated. After examining the abstracts of each study initially, the researchers applied the inclusion criteria to select the studies that could be included within the scope of this study. Through this process 8 journal articles, 22 MA thesis and PhD dissertations were selected for further examination.

Coding Procedures

Due to the limited number of research found in this field in Turkey, the literature was coded through categories and themes. There were two main categories that emerged through participants and setting, which were K-12 schools and teachers or universities and university instructors. From these categories two different themes emerged as being at the forefront of the research in PD and INSET. The two themes emerged by looking at the nature of the research and they were noted as being research that were evaluative or impact research. Each researcher created the categories and codes independently and then crosschecked in regular meetings for con-

sistency. The following section describes the categories and themes in further detail.

FINDINGS

Through an in-depth analysis of each document found in the literature, it became apparent that there were two main settings and participants in the area of PD and INSET. The settings were either in K-12 grade schools and involved teachers there, or university preparatory schools and instructors there. Within these categories two themes were dominant. Most of the research conducted in the area of PD and INSET were either evaluative in nature or had an impact. These two themes are described below.

Evaluative Studies

From the detailed reading of the documents, each researcher became aware that many of the studies that were conducted in the area of PD or INSET were evaluative in nature. What being evaluative means is that the researchers looked at the perceptions of instructors or teachers regarding PD or INSET. The researchers were not interested in looking at an impact of a specific PD or INSET. The evaluative studies then were thematically aligned accordingly to their participants and setting or

Impact Studies

Another theme that emerged as a result of the detailed review of the research was the studies that had an impact as a result of a specific PD or INSET. What is meant by impact is that through the impact studies researchers were interested in looking at a specific PD or INSET and its impact on the participants and setting. Through this impact, these research led to change at most times, therefore played an important role for the field.

The following tables provide a detailed view of the studies that are included in this systematic review with the categories and themes.

- A. University preparatory schools and instructors
 - a. Evaluative studies
 - b. Impact Studies
- B. K-12 Grade Schools and Teachers
 - a. Evaluative Studies
 - b. Impact Studies

DISCUSSION

In this section we provide an analysis of the studies that were noted in the findings section. As presented in the table in the findings section, the research on PD and INSET in the area of EFL is limited in Turkey. Although there have been more than handful of studies conducted in the area of PD/INSET, many of them focused on gathering information and analyzing the needs of the EFL teachers rather than providing them with effective PD/INSET (Arikan 2004; Turhan and Arikan 2009; Kasapoglu 2002; Karaaslan 2003; Eksi 2010; Sahin 2006; Kucuksuleymanoglu 2006; Buyukyavuz and Inal 2008; Iyidogan 2011; Unal 2010).

The common thread among the ten evaluative studies that were analyzed consisted of similar findings. Eight out of the ten studies reached to the following conclusions (Arikan 2004; Turhan and Arikan 2009; Karaaslan 2003; Eksi 2010; Kucuksuleymanoglu 2006; Buyukyavuz and Inal 2008; Iyidogan 2011; Unal 2010): 1) Teachers believed in the importance/necessity of PD/INSET however did not like to attend. 2) The compulsory manner of PD/INSET also created tensions among teachers that decreased their motivation to attend such sessions. 3) Time constraints and inconvenience of settings also were one of the hindrances to their attendance to PD/INSETs. 4) Ministry of National Education's inconsistent needs analysis, offering of the PD/INSETs, and top-down nature of PD/INSETs that are not really geared toward practicing EFL teachers also contribute to the failure of PD/INSETs. 5) Novice and female teachers were found to be more enthusiastic about attending the PD/INSETs. 6) Majority of the teachers prefer not to participate in seminars and do not find them to be useful. In most of the evaluative studies the tendency toward methodology is quantitative, which also is limiting because they do not provide deeper understanding of the participants' views and beliefs (Johnson and Christensen 2008). For example, Arikan's (2004) research study focused on narratives of nine instructors from various universities, which provided a comprehensive understanding of the participants through qualitative interviews, research studies of Turhan and Arikan (2009), Karaaslan (2003), Eksi (2010), and Buyukyavuz and Inal (2008) only used surveys/questionnaires as the main instruments for data collec-

Table 1: Evaluative studies

<i>Author and year</i>	<i>Publication type</i>	<i>Methodology</i>	<i>Participants and setting</i>	<i>Findings/Results</i>
Arikan A 2004	Article	Qualitative narrative study: interview as the only instrument	9 EL instructors from universities	As a result of the interviews that the researcher had conducted there were multiple themes that emerged: 1)Instructors did not have autonomy for PDs offered to the teachers2) Instructors believed that their position in their PD resembles an empty slate. 3) Instructors wanted to take part in the change rather than being made the subjects of PD 4) Instructors had doubts about the quality of administrators and trainers. 5) Instructors believed that they feel uncomfortable in their observations because they often are superficial, mechanical, and fake events that do not reflect real classroom experiences6) Although teachers' trainers often appear to be the authority figure over the teachers, instructors wanted them to have more interpersonal relationship and support them. 7) Instructors disliked the fact that there is a big divide between what works in teachers' classrooms is not considered to be a valid methodology
Turhan IE, Arikan A 2009	Article	Quantitative methodology: questionnaire as an instrument	30 instructors at a preparatory school of a university.	The findings of the pre and post-questionnaire given to instructors resulted in similar findings. The following were highlighted as main findings from the questionnaire responses: 1) The participants believed that INSET courses were part of their PD. 2) Instructors wanted external PD providers and wanted to have PD that allowed reflection. 3) Participants did not like the PD to be obligatory and wanted it to be optional. 4) Novice teachers were more enthusiastic about attending the PD than the experienced teachers. In this pilot study, four teachers engaged in the development of a peer-observation model and reflected upon their experiences of the process. As a result of the peer-observation process, the participants believed that this process contributed positively to their PD.
Kasapoglu AE 2002	MA Thesis	Qualitative methodology: Interviews, peer observations, reflective journals were used as the instruments.	Four teachers-two experienced and two novice who taught at a university preparatory school	
Karaaslan AD 2003	MA Thesis	Quantitative-questionnaire used as an instrument.	110 English language instructors at a university preparatory school.	As a result of the descriptive analysis of the questionnaire the researcher reached the following findings: 1) Participants thought that PD was important for their growth. 2) Peer-observation and action research were not favored by participants. 3) PD was more important for female and inexperienced teachers. 4) The obstacles that prevented teachers from participation into PDs were excessive workload, lack of self-motivation, and institutional support.
Eksi G 2010	MA Thesis	Quantitative-survey research	92 instructors teaching at university preparatory school.	As a result of the questionnaire given to participants the following results were presented by the researcher: 1) Instructors believed in the importance of PD. 2) The most common form of PD that instructors attended were informal discussions with colleagues and

Table 1: Contd...

<i>Author and year</i>	<i>Publication type</i>	<i>Methodology</i>	<i>Participants and setting</i>	<i>Findings/Results</i>
Sahin V 2006	PhD Dissertation	Mixed methodology: Questionnaires, interviews, observations, student work	6 trainees, 2 trainers, and 2 chairpersons of the department at the university, and the students of the trainees and non- trainees.	self-reflection. 3) The inconvenience of dates and times and unrealistic content were the most common excuses for non-attendance in the PDs. 4) The more experienced teachers were found to be the ones who were less interested in participation in PDs. The results of the study reported the researchers' findings of the assessment of the Certificate of Teaching English (CTE) program at the university. According to the findings, although CTE program was effective there needed to be improvements made to the program. The researcher also used Kirkpatrick's model for program evaluation, which was found to be ineffective for the assessment of the particular CTE program.

Table 2: Impact studies

Author and year	Publication type	Methodology	Participants and setting	Findings/Results
Atay D 2008	Article	Qualitative research: narratives and journals used as instruments	62 teachers at a preparatory school of a university	The research included a PD program teaching teachers how to do research in their classrooms led by the researcher. As a result of the six-week PD the teachers conducted classroom research and reported their experiences. The main themes from their experiences were: 1) Increased knowledge in research skills 2) Increased awareness of the teaching/learning process 3) Renewed enthusiasm about teaching 4) Collaboration with colleagues 5) Struggles with research
Arıkan N 2002	MA Thesis	Qualitative study: pre-questionnaire, meeting recordings, interviews, field notes, and participant's reflective journals were used as instruments	13 English language teachers at a university preparatory school	This study reported the initial process of a teacher-study group (TSG) at a university preparatory school. The results indicated that the formation of the TSG was a productive PD for teachers, which allowed them to share their experiences with their colleagues as well as engaged in PD that they wouldn't be able to otherwise.
Sabuncuoğlu O 2006	PhD Dissertation	Quantitative study: questionnaire that asked satisfaction of instructors about PD	250 English instructors from 17 universities in Turkey participated in the study.	As a result of the analyses of the questionnaire about whether they were satisfied or not satisfied with their initial or pre-service education resulted in: 1) The participants were not satisfied with their initial teacher education. 2) Half of them were not confident in their subject knowledge. 3) Although teachers felt confident about knowledge of grammar, they did not know how to express it in a communicative way. 4) Teachers believed that experience alone is not sufficient for the growth of a teacher. 5) Majority of the teachers prefer not to participate in seminars and do not find them to be useful.
Alan B 2003	MA Thesis	Mixed methodology: quantitative surveys and semi-structured interviews were conducted.	17 novice teachers at a university preparatory school participated in this research.	This research reported the novice teachers' perceptions of a 10-week INSET program at the university. The results were as follows: 1) The workshops on classroom management, testing speaking, a teaching and testing grammar were most useful. While teaching reading and vocabulary and material development as least helpful 2) Although the INSET program was helpful, it was suggested that future INSET should focus on more contextual knowledge.
Duzan CU 2006	MA Thesis	Mixed methodology: questionnaire and interviews with participants	12 teachers/trainees and 4 teachers trainers, and 45 experienced teachers from a university preparatory school participated in this research.	This research reported results of the evaluation of the effectiveness of the in-service teacher-training program implemented for newly hire teachers. The results indicated that the trainees needed to improve their teaching skills, therefore the new PD was helpful in helping them to do that, while the experienced teachers did not feel the need to enroll in the in-service training program. As for the teacher-trainers, they were satisfied with the in-service program and provided some suggestions for improvement.
Unal D 2010	MA Thesis	Mixed methodology: pre-and-post-survey done at the beginning and end of the training, and semi-structured interviews with 10 teachers.	10 newly hired and 12 experienced teachers at the university's English preparatory school participated in this research.	This study looked at the implementation and the effectiveness of a new INSET program for teachers at a university preparatory school. According to the results, novice teachers' and experienced teachers' needs were different from each other but they were overall satisfied with the INSET program.

Table 3: Evaluative studies

Author and year	Publication type	Methodology	Participants and setting	Findings/Results
Kucuk suleymanoglu R 2006	Article	Mixed methodology- questionnaires for participating teachers and interviews with instructors were held.	186 teachers and 5 instructors participate in this research.	This study presented the number of INSET activities provided by the Ministry of Education, the views of ELT teachers who participated in these activities and the views of the instructors who participated in the INSET. The results indicated that: 1) There were only 122 INSET programs geared toward ELT from 1998-2005. 2) The interviews with the instructors indicated that the INSET courses were not consistently offered, the curricula were the same and dictated by the ministry, the courses were not separated by the grade level, and needs analysis were not conducted before the courses. 3) The teachers' attitudes about the INSET was that because the needs of the participants were varied the aims of the program were not suitable to participants, their satisfaction and perceptions about the programs also differed due to the mixed grouping of teachers in INSET programs.
Buyukyavuz O, Inal S 2008	Article	Quantitative research methodology was used- questionnaire was used as the main instrument.	132 Turkish teachers of English	The main aim of this research study was to determine the main sources of information used by EFL teachers in Turkey in order to professionally develop themselves and to find out their need for professional development and the resources available to them at their workplaces. Only 26 out of the 132 teachers subscribed to professional journals, 52% of the teachers regularly watched TV and 89% of the teachers had library designed for English teaching at home, in order to receive professional knowledge 24% of the teachers conferred with experienced friends, 89% of the teachers indicated that they benefited from latest developments in the field and 31% of the teachers did not use the internet as a source of knowledge. The topics that the teachers found to be less interested were research skills, testing techniques, learner autonomy, and NLP. The available resources at their workplaces were noted as audio-visual materials. Interestingly that the teachers did not consider in-service seminars offered by the ministry of education to be effective sources of knowledge.
Iyidogan F 2011	MA Thesis	Qualitative- interviews were used as the primary instruments	6 experienced English teachers in primary and secondary schools in two different cities	The aim of this research was to find out the reasons why teachers decide to participate or not participate in PD activities. The results indicated that: 1) All participants agreed upon the importance of PD toward their professional growth. 2) Being married and having children did not have a large impact on their decision to attend PDs. 3) Teachers with over 20 years of experience had negative attitudes toward PDs. 4) The salary is not an indicator of a decision to attend PDs.

Table 3: Contd...

<i>Author and year</i>	<i>Publication type</i>	<i>Methodology</i>	<i>Participants and setting</i>	<i>Findings/Results</i>
Unal E 2010	MA Thesis	Mixed methodology- questionnaires and interviews with teachers.	150 EFL teachers and 50 school administrators	The aim of this research was to find out how INSET programs are designed and how teachers and administrators conceptualize these programs in Turkey. The results indicated that: 1) The INSET programs designed by the ministry of education are mandatory for all teachers. 2) Many teachers are willing to participate in INSET however they dislike the fact that they are often compulsory. 3) The two major obstacles that teachers mention for non-attendance in INSET are inconvenient location and time. 4) A significant number of teachers thought that INSET programs "never" meet their needs. 5) Teachers indicated a need for INSET programs in Computer-based language teaching, education programs abroad, speaking, using drama in FLI, and evaluation and development of course materials. 6) Administrators also believed that INSETs are not designed specifically for teachers' needs.

Table 4: Impact studies

<i>Author and year</i>	<i>Publication type</i>	<i>Methodology</i>	<i>Participants and setting</i>	<i>Findings/Results</i>
Atay D 2001	PhD Dissertation	Mixed methodology- experimental and control groups in quantitative and semi-structured interviews.	40 teachers- 20 public and 20 private schools and 20 students from ELT department of a university	This study examined the collaborative dialogue and knowledge transmission between student teachers and supervising teachers in schools. The results indicated that: 1) Supervising teachers in experimental group showed a significant growth in many of the teaching practices.
Atay D 2004	Article	Mixed methodology- in-service training sessions, semi-structured interviews, and observations were conducted.	Twenty English teachers from public and private schools and twenty student teachers from the university participated in this study.	The aim of the research was to investigate the effects of a collaborative dialogue with student-teachers as a follow-up to training and development based-INSET that focused on the PD and classroom practices of cooperating teachers (CT). The results indicated that 1) CTs reported that they gained awareness of their own teaching, they were able to incorporate theoretical knowledge into practice, and their enthusiasm was renewed as a result of the collaborative dialogue with student teachers (ST). 2) The CTs developed their skills on asking genuine questions and reacting to messages more effectively.
Atay D 2006	Article	Qualitative methodology- Journals kept by pre-service teachers, informal talks with in-service teachers and researcher field-notes.	10 pre-service and 10 in-service teachers participated in the study.	The aim of the research was to find out how does collaborative action research affect the professional competence of pre and in-service teachers. The results of the research indicated that: 1) In-service teachers' perceptions about research changed, they gained increased awareness of their own teaching, and they gained appreciation for collaboration. 2) In addition to teachers' gained knowledge the PTs also indicated that they also enriched their knowledge through this collaboration.
Daloglu A 2004	Article	Mixed methodology: Quantitative questionnaire at the end of the PD for teachers, then interviews were conducted on the effectiveness of the program.	45 teachers teaching in the primary grades (1-5) and the researcher at a private school	The results of this research were: 1) teachers appreciated and found the PD useful 2) Teachers felt like they benefited from the PD program 3) Teachers also felt that administrators were supportive of the PD 4) Teachers also felt that they grew as a professionals and gained self-confidence through the program 5) The communication among the teachers have also improved
Ortactepe P 2006	MA Thesis	Quantitative- Teachers Background Questionnaire, English teachers Sense of Efficacy Scale, Communicative Orientation of Language Teaching Observation Scheme and questionnaire were used as primary instruments.	0 EFL teachers 5 from 8 private schools participated in this study.	The aim of this research was to find out the relationship between Turkish EFL teachers' efficacy and their self-reported practice of CLT and whether an in-service education program had an impact on their PD in terms of teachers' efficacy and their self-reported and observed practice of CLT. The results indicated that: 1) The INSET program provided enhanced teachers' efficacy and self-reported practice of CLT.
Ozcalli S 2007	MA Thesis	Mixed methodology: Questionnaires, interviews and teachers journals were	25 in-service teachers from 5 private schools	The purpose of the study was to analyze the relationship between teacher efficacy and reflective thinking, and the impact of an in-service education program on it. The results showed that 1) The

Table 4: Contd...

Author and year	Publication type	Methodology	Participants and setting	Findings/Results
Surmeli EC 2004	PhD Dissertation	the primary instruments. Qualitative methodology- interviews, repertory grids, questionnaires and reflection sheets were used as primary instruments in this research.	participated in this research. 6 EFL teachers from state schools participated in this research.	INSET program increased teachers' level of efficacy. 2) Journal writing was thought to be beneficial for EFL teachers' practices. The aim of this research was to investigate the effects of NLP techniques on the personal and PD of EFL teachers and to see whether NLP techniques enabled teachers to develop a system o support for themselves to cope with problems with their personal and professional life. The results indicated that: 1) Teacher development opportunities in Turkey are found to be very limited. 2) They can't meet the needs of experienced EFL teachers. 3) The NLP teacher development program enabled teachers to discover their subjective world and connect personal and professional theories, therefore proved to be an important step toward a successful INSET. 4) Teachers' views on content and structure also shifted through the repertory grid.
Kirazlar C 2007	MA Thesis	Mixed: Attitude scale questionnaire toward teaching profession. Reflective Practice questionnaire. Structured diary and interviews were also used as primary instruments.	27 primary school EFL schools from 16 schools.	The aim of this research was to determine the reflective practice of primary school EFL teachers in Canakkale. The second aim was to introduce reflective teaching through the use of a diary in a study, to determine teachers' progress on reflective practices. The results of the study were: 1) Teachers still carried traditional reflection methods like exams, lesson notes. 2) Teachers do not have highly positive toward teaching profession. 3) The diary keeping study was slightly effective toward positive change of teachers' attitudes toward teaching profession. 4) Teachers started to observe and question their teaching through the use of diaries, therefore created new techniques in their classrooms.

tion. In educational research, qualitative research methodology is helpful in understanding the participants' lived experiences through their points of views (Creswell 2009).

Additionally in all of the research that were evaluative, the research only brought forth the issues rather than offering solutions to the issues. In educational research, it is widely popular to point attention to issues but as long as there are not solutions offered, it is unfruitful and does not extend beyond having an understanding of the issues.

Contrary to the evaluative studies, the studies that involved impacted results provided a real-life experience and collaboration among researchers and practitioners (Atay 2008, 2006, 2004, 2001; Arikan 2002; Alan 2003). Atay's (2006, 2008) and Arikan's (2002) research involved the use of narratives and journals kept by participants teachers, which allowed for extensive description of participants' experiences with a specific PD/INSET they were involved in. As a result of impact studies the results were mutually beneficial. The research that engaged both universities and schools in collaboration often resulted in success, therefore universities need to collaborate more with public and private schools.

Another feature of impact studies was the use of mixed methodology through various types of data collection. The use of both quantitative and qualitative method to research provided a rich understanding of the phenomenon under study (Creswell 2009). The combination of questionnaires/surveys and interviews, diaries, and reflective journals allowed researchers to gain an in-depth understanding of participants' real-life experiences toward PD/INSET, and brought awareness to practitioners regarding their professions (Alan 2003; Unal 2010; Daloglu 2004; Ozcalli 2007; Kirazlar 2007). Among all mixed methodologies applied to the studies, the biggest impact was for teachers to be able to reassess their professional identities, reflect on what they may have been missing, and take a step forward toward improving their classroom practices.

Another fruitful result of impact studies is the realization of the importance of collaboration among practitioner peers and university personnel. Among the impact studies surveyed in this review, the results indicated that the participant teachers appreciated the collaborative manner of the PD/INSET that they were involved in and realized the benefits of peer-collabora-

tion and feedback in their professional development experiences (Atay 2001, 2004, 2006; Kirazlar 2007; Ozcalli 2007).

CONCLUSION

The general goals of this systematic review were to determine the previously conducted research articles, thesis and dissertations about PD or INSETs of EFL teachers in Turkey; to review and discuss the impact and implications of the previously conducted research; and to offer recommendations and suggestions for future research in this area.

To conduct this research several databases such as ISI web of Knowledge and YOK were scanned with Boolean Key Words selected for the purposes of this study. After the in depth analysis of the databases and readings, 30 articles, thesis and dissertations were selected to be examined. The publications were read thoroughly and coded under different categories and themes. The two researchers crosschecked the coding scheme for consistency. The various researches were presented and discussed under different categories and themes.

LIMITATIONS

The results of this review should be approached cautiously for several reasons. First this systematic review was limited to only studies conducted in Turkey within the years of 2000-2012, therefore may not be a representative of other contexts. Secondly, the sample for this study was limited to EFL teachers and instructors in Turkish educational institutions. Although every effort to locate all relevant studies, was made there was no way to be certain that the sample of this review included all of the studies that had been conducted in the area of EFL teachers' PD/INSET. We predominantly searched the electronic databases. This review only includes studies published as a journal article, MA thesis, and PhD dissertation in the English language. Finally, due to the limited number of studies found in this area, there was not effort to eliminate studies on the basis of quality.

IMPLICATIONS

Despite the aforementioned limitations, the results of this systematic literature review should serve as a lens to future research in the area of

EFL teachers' PD/INSET. As clearly stated in the review, there is limited research in the field and there is a large need to fill this gap. The following implications should be taken into consideration for further research:

1. PD/INSET topics and the real needs of teachers' must be met through the PD/INSET sessions. Thus, future planning of PD/INSETs should take into consideration the teachers' input.

2. The PD/INSET should be carefully planned and offered regularly and consistently instead of a one-shot sessions.

3. The PD/INSET should be designed and separated among different proficiencies and grade levels such as primary and secondary.

4. Teachers should be given an opportunity to evaluate and reflect on the participated PD/INSET programs.

5. There should be incentives for teachers to participate in PD/INSET programs.

6. There needs to be more research offering PD/INSET programs and looking at its impact.

7. The Ministry of National Education shall appoint personnel (coordinators) responsible for planning and implementation of PD/INSET programs for specific subject areas such as English language teachers. These coordinators shall be practitioners with experience from the field.

8. Teachers should be encouraged to form professional development communities among themselves within the locale of their own schools instead of waiting for others to do it for them.

REFERENCES

- Alan B 2003. *Novice Teachers Perceptions of an In-service Teacher Training Course at Anadolu University*. Master's Thesis, Unpublished. Ankara: Bilkent University.
- Arikan A 2004. Professional development programs and English language instructors: A critical –post-modern study. *Hacettepe University Journal of Education*, 27: 40-49.
- Arikan N 2002. *A Teacher Study Group as an Alternative Method of Professional Development: Analysis of Initial Procedures in Group Formation, Group Dynamics, and Teacher Perceptions of and Attitudes to the TSG*. Master's thesis, Unpublished. Ankara: Bilkent University.
- Atay D 2008. Teacher research for professional development. *ELT Journal*, 62: 139-147.
- Atay D 2001. *The Relationship between Collaboration and Professional Development: Possible Effects of EFL Student Teacher/Supervising Teacher Dialogue on the Beliefs and Instructional Practices of the EFL Supervising Teachers*. PhD Dissertation, Unpublished. Bogazici University.
- Atay D 2004. Collaborative dialogue with student teachers as a follow-up to teacher in-service education and training. *Language Teaching Research*, 8: 143-162.
- Atay D 2006. Teachers' professional development: Partnership in research. *TESL-EJ*, 10: 1-15.
- Buyukyavuz O, Inal S 2008. A descriptive study on Turkish teachers of English regarding their professional needs, efforts for development and available resources. *The Asian EFL Journal*, 10: 215-234.
- Creswell JW 2009. *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative and Mixed Methods Approaches*. 3rd Edition. Thousand Oaks: CA. Sage Publications Inc.
- Daloglu A 2004. A professional development program for primary school English language teachers in Turkey: Designing a materials bank. *International Journal of Educational Development*, 26: 677-690.
- Duzan CU 2006. *An Evaluation of the In-service Teacher Training Program for the Newly Hired Instructors in the School of Foreign Languages at Middle East Technical University*. Master's Thesis, Unpublished. Ankara: Middle Eastern Technical University.
- EF EPI 2012. EF English Proficiency Index 2012 Report. Retrieved January, 21, 2013 From <http://www.ef.com.tr/~/media/efcom/epi/2012/full_reports/ef-epi-2012-report-master-lr-2> (Retrieved January, 21, 2013).
- Eksi G 2010. *An Assessment of the Professional Development Need of English Language Instructors Working at a State University*. Master's Thesis, Unpublished. Ankara: Middle Eastern Technical University.
- Gardner R 1995. On-service teacher education. In: L Anderson (Ed.): *International Encyclopedia of Teaching and Teacher Education*. 2nd Edition. London: Pergamon Press.
- Iyidogan F 2011. *Personal Factors Affecting Experienced English Teachers Decisions Whether Or Not to Engage in Professional Development Activities*. Master's thesis, Unpublished. Ankara, Bilkent University.
- Glattorn A 1995. Teacher development. In: L Anderson (Ed.): *International Encyclopedia of Teaching and Teacher Education*. 2nd Edition. London: Pergamon Press.
- Johnson B, Christensen LB 2008. *Educational Research: Quantitative, Qualitative, and Mixed Approaches*. Thousand Oaks: CA, Sage Publications, Inc.
- Karaaslan AD 2003. *Teachers' Perception of Self-initiated Professional Development a Case Study on Baskent University English Language Teachers*. Master's Thesis, Unpublished. Ankara: Middle East Technical University.
- Kasapoglu AE 2002. *A Suggested Peer Observation Model as Means of Professional Development*. Master's Thesis, Unpublished. Ankara: Bilkent University.
- Kirazlar C 2007. *An Investigation into the Professional Development of Primary School English Language Teachers: The Effects of Keeping Diaries on Teacher Reflection and Attitudes towards Teaching*. Master's

- Thesis, Unpublished. Canakkale Onsekiz Mart University.
- Kucuksuleymanoglu R 2006. In service training of ELT teachers in Turkey between 1998-2005. *Uludag Universitesi Egitim Fakultesi Dergisi*, 19: 359-369.
- Nunan D 2001. English as a global language. *TESOL Quarterly*, 35: 605-606.
- OECD DT 2005. *OECD Turkiye Temel Egitim Politikolari Incelemesi Hakkinda Not. [Note for Investigating Main Turkish Education Policies]*.
- Ortactepe D 2006. *The Relationship between Teacher Efficacy and Professional Development within the Scope of an In-service Teacher Education Program*. Master's Thesis, Unpublished. Istanbul: Bogazici University.
- Ozcalli S 2007. *Possible Effects of In-service Education on Efl Teachers' Professional Development In Terms of Teacher Efficacy and Reflective Thinking*. Master's Thesis, Unpublished. Istanbul: Bogazici University.
- Ozen R 2001. Identifying possible in-service training needs of teachers of English to fourth and fifth graders at primary schools. *Education and Science*, 26: 62-66.
- Richards JC, Farrell TSC 2005. *Reflective Teaching in Second Language Classrooms*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Sabuncuoglu O 2006. *A Study of the Effects of Models of Teacher Education and Professional Development in Elt on Practising and Prospective Teachers of English at Universities*. PhD Dissertation, Unpublished. Izmir: Dokuz Eylul University.
- Surmeli EC 2004. *Implementation of Neuro Linguistic Programming NLP into Personal and Professional Development Programs of English Language Teachers*. PhD Dissertation, Unpublished. Adana: Cukurova University.
- Sahin V 2006. *Evaluation of the In-service Teacher Training Program the Certificate for Teachers of English at the Middle East Technical University School of Foreign Languages*. PhD Dissertation, Unpublished. Ankara: Middle East Technical University.
- Turhan IE, Arikan A 2009. English language teacher development with and without a teacher trainer: ELT instructors' perceptions. *E-Journal of New World Sciences Academy*, 4(2), Article Number: 1C0031
- Unal D 2010. *Designing an In-service Teacher Training Program for English Language Instructors and Identifying the Effectiveness of the Program: An Implication at Afyon Kocatepe University*. Master's Thesis, Unpublished. Ankara: Gazi University.