



Similarities and Differences of Chinese Missionary Dictionaries

Silakova Sofiya Andreevna¹, Glushkova Svetlana Yurievna² and
Filipenko Elizaveta Alekseevna³

^{1,3}*Kazan Federal University, Department of Altaic and Chinese Studies, Kazan, Russia*

²*Saint Petersburg State University, Saint Petersburg, Russia*

E-mail: ¹<silakova.sa@mail.ru>, ²<mega.sppa@mail.ru>, ³<filipenkolisa@mail.ru>

KEYWORDS Bilingual. Chinese. Dictionary. English. Language. Russian. Spiritual Mission

ABSTRACT This study reviewed and compared the two-volume Chinese-Russian dictionary of a member of the Beijing Spiritual Mission, Archimandrite Palladius (Kafarov) and the Chinese-English dictionary of the representative of the British Protestant Mission, Frederick William Baller. These dictionaries are examples of the work of representatives of Christian missions (that is, Orthodox and Protestant) who served in China and studied Chinese. However, the relevance of the study is revealed by the fact that dictionaries, which have been published by different spiritual missions in approximately one period but not considered together, were taken for comparison. Therefore, the study was conducted to identify the main features of the similarities and differences based on the missionaries approaches to compile dictionaries and learning Chinese. Results showed that missionary dictionaries compiled at the end of the 19th century and in the beginning of the 20th century have both similar and different features, which indicates the difference in the scientific approaches of the missionaries who represented different Christian missions that existed in China during a given time period. Although both dictionaries had differences, they are used as the basis for further study of the Chinese language in different countries, which underlines their scientific significance for world sinology. Finally, it could be stated that the results obtained from review and comparison are of scientific importance for addressing the experience of compiling the Chinese dictionaries in Russia and abroad.

INTRODUCTION

Several Christian missions appeared in China at different times. There is a legend that the first Nestorian Christians appeared in China after the pilgrimage of the Apostle Thomas in the first century AD (Lomanov 2002; Xu et al. 2018). However, these data are not confirmed by the practitioners, so researchers used historical sources, and based on which refer the time of Chinese acquaintance with Christianity only to the time of the Tang dynasty (Werner and Sun 2015).

Christianity in China appeared in the 7th century, during the Tang dynasty, but did not take root until it was reintroduced in the 16th century by Jesuit missionaries (Werner and Sun 2015; Liu 2017; He 2018). Today, it comprises Catholics, Protestants, Evangelicals and a small number of Orthodox Christians. Although its history in China is not as ancient as Taoism, Mahayana Buddhism or Confucianism, Christianity, through various ways, has been present in China since at least the 7th century and has gained significant influence during the last 200 years (Bays 2011; Uhalley and Wu 2015).

It is notable that in the past, all representatives of the Christian missionary in China sought to provide Chinese dictionaries for a more successful

work. In order to achieve the above objective, they adhered to different methods and focused on different aspects of the Chinese language and Chinese reality. In this regard, the present study analyzed similarities and differences in the Chinese dictionaries of two well-known sinologists called Archimandrite Palladius (Kafarov) and Frederick William Baller (Palladius 1876; Baller 1892; Shapiro 2010).

Objectives

This study reviewed and compared the two-volume Chinese-Russian dictionary of a member of the Beijing Spiritual Mission, Archimandrite Palladius (Kafarov) and the Chinese-English dictionary of the representative of the British Protestant Mission, Frederick William Baller.

METHODOLOGY

The researchers used a system of general scientific and interdisciplinary methods that are used in the linguistic and historical research. This is a multi-approach method. In fact, comparative method was utilized to identify the features of structural organization of dictionary entries and lexical material between several dictionaries of the same type, reflecting the same synchronous

section of the Chinese language. Moreover, the researchers applied chronological method to study the emergence of Christian missionary work in China and its lexicographical activity, and comparative historical method to identify similarities and differences in the development of the Spiritual Missions under study in China and their contribution to Sinology and substantiate any differences in their approaches to the compilation of dictionary works based on the historical events. Finally, the researchers used content analysis to analyze dictionaries, thanks to which we could assess the content of dictionaries in question.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The story of the appearance of the Russian Orthodox Mission in Beijing began with the seizure of the Albazin burg in 1685, when, after the defeat of the Cossacks, some prisoners with their families were sent to Beijing. In 1711, the Russian Mission under the leadership of Archimandrite Hilarion (Lezhaysky) (1712-17280) was sent to Beijing for the first time. In the past, the Mission's stay in Beijing's Bei-Guan was regulated by the 5th article of the Kyakhta treatise of 1727 (Skachkov 1977).

In fact, one of the main goals of the missionaries was to master the Chinese, Manchu, and Mongolian languages, which would further contribute both to the study of China's scientific and cultural heritage and to the improvement of trade and diplomatic relations between the two neighboring states.

However, the missionaries and disciples' success at the Mission did not last too much. One of the first translators of the Chinese and Manchu languages, respected by the Manchu government, was disciple of the second mission of Archimandrite Anthony (Platkovsky) (1729-1735), Illarion Kalinovich Rossokhin. He probably became the creator of the first Russian-Chinese dictionary. However, the dictionary, as many of his works, was not published, which was probably caused by the conflict of interests of Rossokhin and foreign scientists, who had a majority in the Russian Academy of Sciences. In addition, up to the middle of the XVIII century, there was a problem with the lack of machine tools required for printing hieroglyphs in Russia (Dacyshen 2013).

One of the few Chinese-Russian dictionaries of the Russian mission that has survived to date was the two-volume "Chinese-Russian dictionary compiled by the former head of the Beijing spiritual mission, Archimandrite Palladius and senior dragoman man of the diplomatic mission published in 1875-1889 (Palladius 1876). One of the copies of this dictionary is kept in the Russian National Library of St. Petersburg.

As shown in the title, the authors of the dictionary were participants of the XII Spiritual mission (1840-1849), the chief of XIII (1850-1858) and XV (1865-1878) missions' archimandrite Palladius (Kafarov), and students of the XV mission Pavel Stepanovich Popov, who became later a senior dragoman of the imperial diplomatic mission in Beijing.

In 1871, while returning from an expedition to the South Ussuri region, Archimandrite Palladius spent the next 8 years compiling a Russian-Chinese dictionary. However, half of the dictionary was written by the time of his death in 1878, but as said by Pavel Popov, Archimandrite Palladius was able to compile a truly impressive dictionary of the most important terms on Confucianism, Buddhism, and Taoism. This work surpassed all the works available at that time in the number and completeness of the definitions of the terms relating to the three teachings of China. Archimandrite himself called his work "a swan song and a spokesman for views in China in all its manifestations" (Popov 1888; He 2018).

Nonetheless, the above work could not have been uncompleted and missing in the manuscripts. After Palladius death, Pavel Popov took over the work at the end of the dictionary, spent about 6 years on writing it, and published it in two volumes in Beijing in 1888. For his work, Popov received the title of the corresponding member of the Academy of Sciences (Popov 1888; Koncevich 2002).

Of course, the structure of the dictionary divides the text, first in Chinese and then in Russian. The words in this dictionary are distributed according to the phonetic principle. Correspondingly, Archimandrite Palladium uses a system of writing Chinese words, which was modified by him. Such a transcription system, with minor changes in the spelling after 1917, has survived to this day and is still used. However, one of the main drawbacks of the Palladium system is the lack of tones in the transcription.

For each basic (nesting) hieroglyph with transcription, translation, and explanation (if necessary), the dictionary contains instances in multiple words, with the authors choosing words from a wide thematic range as examples: there are terms related to botany (瓜 Melon - 'pumpkin vegetables', 瓠瓜 hugua - 'little pot' (lagenaria), Chinese culture (女媧 nvgua - 'fabulous maiden of antiquity, a strange creation of Chinese fantasy; had the appearance of a man with a snake head; changed 70 times a day') and other areas of knowledge, which emphasizes the volume and versatility of the sinologists' labor.

Moreover, as mentioned earlier, there are examples of Buddhist, Taoist, and Confucian terms in the dictionary:

“阿羅漢 Alohan – arhat; that is, honorable; Buddhist title of Buddha. In addition, the biblical E-lo-a is God” in the Christian monument of the 9th century by the same signs (He 2018).

“仁 Ren – philanthropy. According to the old style, it refers to the evenly love to everything, while according to the most ancient, it represents a thousand hearts. It is also considered the main virtue in relation to the highest to the lowest”.

“無 Wu - no, not to be, without. In the Taoists, it refers to the source of being. However, in Buddhists, it implies four concepts of 1. What is not yet, 2. What was and is no longer, 3. What is not in the other, and 4. Absolute non-existence, which cannot be allowed” (Semenas 1979).

The dictionary also has an advantage that is a search for characters by keys. The second volume includes pages with a list of all 214 key characters with an indication of the number of features in them and options for reading. In addition, there is a “Pointer to find difficult characters”, which is a table built on the principle of “hieroglyph-digit-digit”, where the first digit is the main key number in the key index, and the second digit is the number of features in the desired hieroglyph (Semenas 1979).

However, researchers highlight the lack of examples of the use of words and the lack of indication of sources as the shortcomings of the “Chinese-Russian dictionary”, from where certain terms were taken (Morrison 1879).

Although this dictionary has been written at the end of the 19th century, it is still relevant primarily for researchers of the three Chinese teachings (Confucianism, Buddhism, and Taoism), because

it defines as accurately as possible most religious concepts.

Notably, Protestantism came to China after Catholicism and Orthodoxy. At first, the Dutch, entrenched in Taiwan, converted more than two thousand local people into Christianity in the 17th century. However, they could not further develop their activities, and therefore the traditional starting point for the Protestant missionaries' activities in China is considered to be the year 1807, when the envoy of the London Missionary Society, Robert Morrison, arrived in China. As a graduate of the missionary school, Morrison took holy orders and was sent to China as an interpreter for the East India Company. In addition to translation, he was engaged in science and the study of the Chinese language and culture. Robert Morrison also has a “Chinese Dictionary in Three Parts” (Dacyshen 2013). At the same time, he practically did not work on the Christianization of the Chinese population, converting only 10 people to Christianity during his life in China; however, he noted that all of them were true believers, and not so-called “rice Christians”; that is, those who accepted the new faith from this or that benefit, most often the property.

Of course, the prolonged ban of the Ch'ing government on conducting Christian preaching in China after “ritual disputes” affected the nature of the activities of the Protestant mission (Broomhall 1915). Actually, much attention was paid to the missionaries' precise scientific work and the study of languages. The mission considered the translation activity and creation of a complex of Protestant spiritual literature in Chinese to be no less important.

Then, a graduate of the London Missionary Institute, Frederick William Baller, arrived at the China Inland Mission in Nanjing in 1873. Baller sufficiently studied Chinese and then he went to the Mission's office in Anhui and Jiangsu Provinces, taking up the position of Mission Superintendent. A few years later, Baller became the head of a new educational institution for training missionaries (Baller 1900). He simultaneously began extensive scientific and translation work. In fact, he provided translations of the Bible and Bible stories in Chinese, several monographs devoted to the study of the Chinese language, as well as the “Analytical Chinese-English Dictionary”, published in Shanghai in 1900 (Baller 1900).

According to the author, “An analytical Chinese-English dictionary, which had been compiled for the China Inland Mission” was created as an easy-to-use and inexpensive dictionary, the material of which should be enough for the user to read journalistic texts.

It should be noted that materials for the dictionary was selected after careful analysis of classical Chinese books, the Four Books with commentaries and other Chinese classical books, as well as the Old and New Testaments and the writings of Luther. Thus, by including the classic 6000 characters in the work of the sources, which, according to Giles, are sufficient for the work of a scientist, another six hundred hieroglyphs were added. In total, 6089 words have been included in the dictionary, and if you count the hieroglyphs of different types, it would reach 7264 words. In this regard, Baller wrote that his dictionary was “an ample supply for any scientist” (“an ample stock-in-trade for any scholar”) (Baller 1900).

However, this dictionary was not a completely new and unique work. Most of the terms were supplied with examples taken from the dictionaries of Morrison, Williams, Giles and other Sinology missionaries, as well as the aforementioned sources.

Interestingly, if you study Baller’s work, you can see an approach different from that used by Archimandrite Palladius. Although Baller used a large number of topics (for example, philosophy, religion, biology, botany, etc.) in the Palladius-Popov dictionary, he was guided by the need not to clutter his vocabulary with the terms related to narrow areas of a particular science; for example, he proposed to create separate dictionaries for the names of birds, animals, plants, and technical terms and dialects. The dictionary also includes an addition, which consists of the terms used in the Four Book and comments to it.

In addition, the numbering of hieroglyphs is consistent, which contributes to study hieroglyphs with the help of cross references; that is, the search for a hieroglyph by keys familiar to the modern researcher, which would be in effect, and according to the author, it allows the trainee to analyze and remember the constituent parts of each hieroglyph and prepare them to analyze the structure of the Chinese sentence when reading. However, Baller (1900) noted that the amount of his labor and the expected level of language proficiency of the

users did not imply the inclusion of the words in the etymology dictionary. Moreover, the origin of one or another hieroglyph is indicated quite rarely.

The dictionary structure, as well as of the Palladium dictionary, divides the text into Chinese, then in Russian, the words are distributed according to the phonetic principle. Chinese words are transcribed using their own transcription system (“Baller transcription”). The system was similar to the well-known Wade-Giles system, but its feature was that some vowels of the Chinese phonetic alphabet were changed to others when writing in this system, especially when combined with certain consonants. Thus, the final “e” was converted to “o” or “oh” after “g” and “k”, but it was recorded as “e” “ch” in the remaining cases. After the initials “zh”, “ch”, “sh”, and “r”, the vowel “i” was recorded as “ih”, but it was transcribed as “i” in the case of joining “z”, “c”, and “s”. The final “” was made only after the initials “j” and “q”, but the “iung” was used in the remaining cases. Moreover, the vowel “o” was often transcribed “eh” in combination with “p”, “b”, and “m”. however, after “g”, “k”, “h”, and “ui”, it was converted to “uei”, and the transfer to “uo” was carried out through “uo”/“uoh” in combination with “g”, “k”, and “h”, and through “o”/“oh” in other cases. This system was not used later in other dictionaries in order to avoid confusion in transcribing, as there were too many possible exceptions to the general rules. As many other transcription systems, they were later completely replaced by the Wade-Giles transcription system.

Here, it should be noted that most of the examples for hieroglyphs are built on the principle of using the desired word at the very beginning. Therefore, it was assumed that this should facilitate the search and save the researcher’s time.

In particular, Baller noted that he used only words that are used in the so-called standardized Chinese (‘*guanhua*’) in his work, which, he claims, were spoken by more than 2.3 of the Chinese population. However, pronunciation of the hieroglyphs was borrowed from the western provinces. The tones were indicated by the numbers to the right of the hieroglyphs.

As demonstrated by the comparisons and analyses, both dictionaries are quite easy to use, but they have certain disadvantages. For example, the main disadvantage concerns the imperfection of the transcription systems.

CONCLUSION

It is concluded that Baller's dictionary differs from Archimandrite Palladius's because the authors had different goals when compiling dictionaries. In fact, Palladius's dictionary is rather an academic work for Sinologists, a kind of encyclopedia of various areas of culture, history, philosophy, religion, biology, geography, and literature of China. Baller also hoped to use his vocabulary for educational purposes and, in practice, for students, teachers, and priests, as evidenced not only by the commentary of the sinologist himself, but also by applications that include information about 214 keys of the Chinese language, the main words used in the Four Books, tables of dynasties and rulers (indicating the motto of the government) of China, the zodiacal table, and others. However, Baller's work is practically not cluttered with rarely used words, and the vocabulary involved has more practical and everyday use.

RECOMMENDATIONS

This study reviewed and compared the two-volume Chinese-Russian dictionary of a member of the Beijing Spiritual Mission, Archimandrite Palladius (Kafarov) and the Chinese-English dictionary of the representative of the British Protestant Mission, Frederick William Baller. It was recommended to compare the result of this study with other new dictionary.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

This study was conducted according to the Russian Government Program of Competitive Growth of Kazan Federal University.

REFERENCES

- Baller FW 1892. *The Sacred Edict: With a Translation of the Colloquial Rendering, Notes and Vocabulary*. Volume 1. London: Forgotten Books Publisher.
- Baller FW 1900. *An Analytical Chinese-English Dictionary: Compiled for the China Inland Mission*. Sydney: China Inland Mission and American Presbyterian Mission Press.
- Bays DH 2011. *A New History of Christianity in China*. Volume 7. New Jersey: John Wiley & Sons.
- Broomhall M 1915. *The Jubilee Story of the China Inland Mission*. London: Nabu Press.
- Lomanov AV 2002. *Christianity and Chinese Culture*. Moscow: Vost Lit. Michigan: Eerdmans.
- Dacyshen V 2013. *Russian Sinologists of the 18th - Early 20th Centuries: Teachers and Compilers of Dictionaries (Brief Bio-Bibliographic Reference Book)*. Russian Studies in History, 1: 532-550 (In Russian).
- He S 2018. China's Christianity: From missionary to indigenous church. *Asian Ethnology*, 77(1/2): 420-421.
- Koncevich LR 2002. *Chinese Proper Names and Terms in the Russian Text*. Moscow: Muravej (In Russian).
- Liu L 2017. The past and present of the Christianity in China. *Chronos*, 36: 197-220.
- Palladius A 1876. *Elucidations of Marco Polo's Travels in North-China, Drawn from Chinese Sources. Office of the North-China Branch. Royal Asiatic Society*.
- Popov PS 1888. *A Diary of Two Months in Peking*.
- Morrison R 1879. *A Dictionary of the Chinese Language. Tien-shih-chai*. London: Nabu Press.
- Semenas AL 1979. *P. I. Kafarov as a Lexicographer*. Moscow: Nauka (In Russian).
- Shapiro R 2010. Chinese Pidgin Russian. *Journal of Pidgin and Creole Languages*, 25(1): 5-62.
- Skachkov PE 1977. *Essays on the History of Russian Sinology*. Moscow: Nauka (In Russian).
- Uhalley S, Wu X 2015. *China and Christianity: Burdened Past, Hopeful Future: Burdened Past, Hopeful Future*. UK: Routledge.
- Werner D, Sun XP 2015. Christianity in China. *The Ecumenical Review*, 67(1): 1-6.
- Xu H, Pak J, Tu R, Schuberg M 2018. Exploring attachment and spirituality among Christians in China. *Asian Journal of Social Science Studies*, 3(3): 11-27.

Paper received for publication in October, 2019

Paper accepted for publication in December, 2019