

The Migration of Indian Teachers from KwaZulu Natal, South Africa to the United Kingdom: Escaping Adverse Leadership and Management

Sadhana Manik

*School of Education and Development, University of KwaZulu-Natal, P.O.Box 1632,
Verulam 4340, KwaZulu-Natal, South Africa
E-mail: manik@ukzn.ac.za*

KEYWORDS Transnational Migration. Indian Teachers. School Environment. School Leadership

ABSTRACT Time – space compression has contributed to a substantial increase in migration worldwide. Professionals and service industry employees are most prone to transnational mobility at present. The declaration by countries to achieve UNESCO's Education for All targets by 2015 has led to pressure to attract and employ teachers (locally and from abroad) to meet the desired needs. This paper presents an analysis of Indian teachers' career decision to leave South Africa (SA) to embrace teaching opportunities in the United Kingdom (UK). The data used is drawn from a predominantly qualitative doctoral study completed in 2005 which examined the nature of teacher migration between SA and the UK. While there are a host of reasons that blend to create an impetus to exit SA (such as finance, travel, education policy changes in SA), this paper focuses primarily on the nature of school environment in ex-House of Delegates (HOD) public schools in KwaZulu Natal province (KZN) of SA as a facet of the career reason for migration. The paper begins by contextualising the migration of teachers within the global labour migration debate and then charts some of the major changes in SA education and the corresponding implications for leadership and management in schools. It thereafter explores Indian migrant teachers' articulations of their negative experiences with Indian principals at ex-HOD schools which prompted their exit from SA. This is followed by their comparisons of the school environment (upon transnational migration), more especially encouraging experiences with leadership and management, in UK schools. The paper culminates by commenting on the need for more studies and for education stakeholders to assist in preparing school leaders via workshop initiatives to address the culture and ethos at ex-HOD schools post-apartheid.

INTRODUCTION

It's not surprising that globalisation (advancements in transport, information and communication technologies) with places converging on one another has led to increased transnational migrations. That this phenomenon will not abate anytime soon is also of no surprise; neither is the heightened global debate on brain drain, gain and circulation for countries (Nurse 2004; Miller 2007; Ramphal Commission 2009; Commonwealth Secretariat 2010). Developed countries' (such as the UK and US) desire to address their critical needs such as a lack of teachers has led to innovative strategies to attract and retain teachers from abroad (Manik 2005; Mulvaney 2005; AFT 2009; de Villiers and Book 2009). Ironically, teachers exiting from particular developing countries (such as South Africa and the Phillipines) are equally in demand in their home countries due to local shortages in subjects such as Math and Science. As national borders appear to no longer serve as an obstacle to migration, the pool of schools widen to which teachers can apply for positions.

Hence the onus falls on schools and national education departments in developing countries to create an attractive, healthy and supportive environment for local teachers or run the risk of losing them to international recruitment agencies offering rewarding work and travel packages overseas (Manik 2010).

Leadership, Management and Organizational Culture

Varuhas et al. (2003) cite Bond et al. (1998) who reveal that support in the workplace, a facet of organisational culture, is closely tied to employees' well-being, their job satisfaction, retention and loyalty to their employers (sic Country!). Mestry et al. (2006) in their study, using ethnographic and narrative inquiry, investigated the role of leaders in shaping the culture, direction and development of the school. Despite there not being any Indian teachers in the sample, I believe that their findings are instructional. The overarching discovery was that leaders influence the school culture. They articulate the view that

“leaders have the responsibility of providing the necessary guidance and support to teachers... or...detrimental effect to the school culture” (Mestry et al. 2006: 08). Indeed support at work featured as a more significant predictor of job satisfaction than salary and benefits. I am in agreement with Evans (2001) who argues that school principals through their leadership and management skills have the potential to also cuckoon teachers from negative influences and to foster a positive outlook (Evans 2001).

However leadership and management, though frequently used in studies, appear to be problematic concepts. Whilst there are views espoused that leadership and management are closely related, there are other scholars who are of the opinion that it is one and the same. There are also those who refuse to conflate the concepts such as Sindrajh (2007: 32). He states that “The difference between leadership and management is that leadership relates to mission, direction and inspiration whilst management involves designing and carrying out plans, getting things done and working effectively with people. A school principal has to be both leader and manager.” With regard to the use of these concepts in this paper, I agree with Sindrajh (2007) in terms of his understanding of the concepts of leadership and management and I am also of the view that given this close relationship between leadership and management, they should not be separated in discussion. A follow-up question that then seeks a response is: do present school leaders in SA with their existing leadership and management style have the requisite skills and abilities to nurture and develop a healthy school environment?

It is well known that apartheid education in South Africa lacked a singular legislative framework to provide the foundation of governance in public schools. Pre 1994², schools were undemocratic and demarcated along lines of race. Thus, the leadership and management style that dominated was authoritarian with principals dictating and lacking in consultative decision making. Strangely, whilst the school populations have to some extent desegregated since the demise of apartheid, teacher desegregation in schools have been slow to follow suit especially in ex-HOD schools (Moletsane 1999). In Balkaran’s (2007: 86) doctoral study which is a spatial analysis of teacher desegregation in schools in KwaZulu Natal, South Africa, she

revealed that of 59 917 teachers profiled in KZN province, given the “race distribution of teachers, schools are still predominantly staffed as they were in the apartheid era. The majority of teachers in each racial category were employed at schools that were historically designated to their own race.” Sindrajh’s (2007) study exploring transformation in leadership and management styles of primary school principals in eThekweni Region, KZN (since democracy in 1994) attempted to be inclusive, achieving a balance along lines of race. However, his responses from 95 questionnaires highlighted that 60% of participants were from ex-HOD schools, 25% from ex- HOR schools and and 15% from ex-HOA schools. Thus although SA is 16 years into democracy, many public schools³ are still plagued by division according to race.

Another interesting dimension is that of the gender disparity between senior management and level one teachers in public schools⁴. Weber (2005: 67) has revealed that men dominate senior management in SA schools yet the profession has a majority of women. He points out that no attention has been given to ‘the gendered relations between senior management and junior colleagues’ and this should be interrogated.

Democracy and Leadership: An Unholy Alliance?

Democracy within education in South Africa, was initiated by a host of policies which outlined numerous aspects of school life such as a change in curriculum (C2005, National Curriculum Statements), change in the role functions⁵ of teachers (Norms and standards of 2000) and in the management of schools (South African Schools Act 84 of 1996). School governance and management is shared between the school governing body (SGB) and school management team (principal, deputies and heads of department) which flagged a change from a centralised education controlled by the department of education to school autonomy. The SGB consists of the principal, elected parents, teachers, non-teaching staff, and in high schools - learners. SGB functions include making teaching and non-teaching appointments and the financial management of the school. Sindrajh (2007) draws on the Department of Education’s (1996: 25) statement that “new education policies require managers who are able to work in democratic and participative ways to build relationships and ensure

efficient and effective delivery.” He believes that since “more authority and decision-making has shifted to school level than in previous years (during apartheid)” this implies that “school principals are faced with a challenge of delivering quality leadership and management, because the functionality of school is closely linked to the quality of the principals’ leadership style and approach. Indeed it has been previously expressed that leadership is important in generating organisational change (ccgov.eu 2006).

The SA Department of Education’s White Paper on Education and Training (Department of Education, 1995), the 2nd White Paper (Department of Education, 1996) and in the appointment of a National Task Team on Education Management Development acknowledged the value of developing democratic effective management in education since the values espoused in the new constitution would need to filter into all aspects of schooling. November et al. (2010) question whether principals and educators are knowledgeable about applying democratic principles in the school context. Research by van der Westhuizen et al. (2002) in the Mpumalanga province of SA, indicates that changes in the education system have resulted in many present school principals being labeled as ineffective in school management. It is therefore understandable that Sindrajh (2007) criticizes the national department of education in South Africa for failing to have a coherent policy (despite these numerous policy documents annually) or strategy to empower⁶ principals. Bush and Oduro (2006: 359) who have written on the extent of preparation of principals in the teaching context of Africa note that “there is rarely any formal leadership training and principals are appointed on the basis of their teaching record rather than their leadership potential.” They add that there is limited induction and support. This is also a finding by Sindrajh (2007) in his local KZN study. McLennan (1995) had previously suggested that capacity development in the systems, structures, ethos and managers of the education system remain a challenge of educational management. Capacity development appears to be the key way forward and Sindrajh (2007) draws on Gultig and Butler (1997: 62 – 63) who provide salient democratic changes in the way South African schools must be organized in terms of management. Among these are the following which this paper uses to benchmark good management: principals should

lead rather than instruct, the decision-making hierarchy must become flatter (more consultative), creating a culture of learning, rather than controlling behaviour and commanding respect through stature and not status.

Drawing on Cox’s (2001) two categories of leadership: transactional and transformational⁷, Sindrajh (2007: 82) highlights the qualities of a transformational leader: not dictatorial, has an open door policy, is receptive to new ideas and suggestions, is approachable and easily accessible to all staff members.” He reveals that 76% of participants in his study viewed principals as transactional in their leadership styles. This was contrary to the view of the 6 principals in his study of which 85% indicated that they have transformed and adopted a transformational style of leadership. There thus appears to be a disjuncture between teachers’ perceptions of the principal’s leadership style and the principal’s perception of his leadership style. This is useful as principals may be unaware of staff perceptions and the impacts of his particular leadership style, in this manner paving the way for teacher discontent and possible recruitment to the UK. Sindrajh’s (2007) study recommends amongst others, a climate in schools conducive for working and the induction of principals into transformational leadership.

The 2005 doctoral study being reported on in this article revealed that newly qualified White teachers, 28 years and younger and seasoned Indian teachers, 29-42 years of age from ex-HOD public schools were exiting SA. However, this paper presents a segment of Indian teachers’ career decision to leave SA to embrace teaching opportunities in the UK. Whilst teachers cited poor salary⁸ as part of their career discontent, it is not explored in this article, having being discussed in previous articles. But rather the discussion hones in on the nature of the school environment in ex-House of Delegates (HOD) public schools in KZN province (which was cited as part of the career reason) where leadership and management styles were so toxic (harmful) at times that it provided a trigger for teacher migration to the UK.

SOURCE AND MODES OF DATA COLLECTION

The data used in this discussion is drawn from a predominantly ethnographic doctoral study

completed in 2005 which examined the nature of teacher migration between SA and the UK.

The study drew on various modes of data collection such as: questionnaires, semi-structured interviews, focus group discussions, diary and email entries and classroom observation.

In terms of the questionnaires, 120 were completed by participants: 90 who were seasoned teachers (30 pre migrant teachers, 30 post migrant teachers and 30 return migrant teachers) and 30 who were novice teachers⁹. This article focuses solely on seasoned teachers (n=90) and in particular Indian teachers who consisted of 81% (n=73) of this cohort (pre, post and return migrant questionnaires), 31 interviews (7 pre-migrant teachers, 13 post-migrant teachers and 11 return-migrant teachers) and email correspondence.

FINDINGS

The nature of the school environment cannot be overlooked for its importance in ensuring the well-being of the teacher by providing support and encouragement, in addition to creating opportunities for professional growth and development. The discussion begins by examining migrant teachers articulations of a lack of upward career mobility and poor management in local schools. Experiences of increased workloads for teachers and the existence of subcultures at school are assessed. In UK schools migrant teachers spoke of collaborative cultures, which aid professional growth whilst in SA schools migrant teachers (pre and post) alluded to corrosive organizational cultures that hindered their growth.

a) Lack of Upward Career Mobility and Poor Management

Ravin (pre-migrant interview, 26-07-03) stated that he was frustrated at the lack of progress he had made in 19 years as a teacher. He felt trapped by the limited opportunities in the field of technology to advance to the position of Head of Department. Meena (pre-migrant interview, 12-05-03) shared his sentiments although she was a teacher in the Languages and Literacy Department. She had been teaching for 14 years and she believed that in terms of length of service she should qualify for a promotion. However, she was of the opinion that she was not successful mainly due to the influence of the school governing body.

Les was bitter about the lack of career opportunities for teachers in comparison to other state departments and the consequences of having the School Governing Body (SGB)¹⁰ play a determining role in appointments (pre-migrant interview, 07-08-03). He commented on the absence of incentives and the influence of nepotism in promotion appointments:

Every other state department has a merit pay system. Our department for the last 12 years has no such incentive. In particular ex HOD schools – the government penalized us, our own people penalized us - that's been the status quo. In White schools all teachers got their 3 merit notches (which translated into an increase in pay), not in Indian schools.

There is no upward mobility now with the governing body. Now there's nepotism, I can say goodbye to a promotion - in my own school I applied for the HOD post and I didn't even get shortlisted (yet he occupied the acting HOD post).

Jacklin (2001) has noted that the demise of apartheid was followed by the removal of a differentiation of schools based on race, ethnicity or language but Balkaran's study has highlighted the absence of extensive desegregation at the level of school staffing. Thus, the apartheid status quo in school staffing are being maintained. Les felt that there exists a destructive culture¹¹ at ex-HOD schools, which is responsible for the erosion of teachers' professional identities.

At the time of this interview Les was unaware that negotiations at ELRC (Education Labour Relations Council) had led to discussions on pay progression, which was to be introduced by the DoE. SADTU indicated to its members that July 2004 was supposed to be the tentative date for the first pay progression. At present teachers are assessed for their efficiency in the classroom (by management) and this has since resulted in the implementation of additional pay.¹²

Post-migrant teachers (interviews, Ria 18-08-03, Sera 14-08-03, Des 05-08-03, SA) who professed that they had no chance of being promoted declared that they had dedicated time and effort to enhancing the performance of pupils in certain extra mural activities but were not rewarded for their efforts. They felt hurt and unappreciated for their input. Notwithstanding their enthusiasm and capacity for positive change, they were reminded by members of senior

management that, they would not be eligible for promotion. These teachers were bitter because regardless of their contribution to improving school, they would be overlooked in times of promotion as they were young. This was the turning point for such teachers and it prompted them to exit SA.

Ria (post-migrant interview, 18-08-03) said:

I've been a teacher for 7 years and I've been told that I'm too young to be promoted. Here in SA it's who you know, who can help you get to the top. I've worked hard but those with a shorter skirt have gone ahead, its morally wrong and I won't do it. The only chance I have of being promoted here is if I'm between 50-60 years of age.

Prior to 1996 the DoE was responsible for undertaking promotions. With the advent of the South African Schools Act (SASA 1996) the onus rests on the SGB to effect promotions. This method was in conflict with those teachers who were of the opinion that members of management at schools (SMT) were colluding with the SGB and influencing promotions. Post-Migrant teachers thus believed that the process of promotions was being unfairly managed. The Employment of Educators Act of 1994, and amendments in 1998 did not include age as a criterion for appointments. Des (post-migrant interview, 05-08-03) stated that he had been a teacher for nine years and he felt *stuck in the same place with no promise of any change*. Sera (post-migrant interview, 14-08-03) recalled how she annually fought a battle at staff level to have a prom ball¹³ at the school. The lack of extra-curricular activities dampened her zeal: *Morale at the school is so low that nobody is enthusiastic about participation... I'm the only one who wants to do things. I got fed up of having to convince people of the advantages of such an event*.

Teachers were articulating their lack of vertical career growth and no support by school administration for their professional efforts in South Africa. Varuhas et al. (2003) have highlighted the value of support to job satisfaction and retention. Hargreaves (1994) has noted that teachers' expectations and frustrations in their career affect their morale. Thus, if it were possible to analyse emotions as Zembylas (2002: 188) has suggested, then "teacher burn-out is a reality when teachers' professional work is either inadequately supported or undermined by the school administration, colleagues or parents". According to Zembylas

(2002) there are three dimensions to burnout, one of which is applicable to the above-mentioned teachers, namely emotional exhaustion which is "a chronic state of physical and emotional depletion that results from excessive job demands and continuous stress... being emotionally over-extended and exhausted by one's work (Wright and Cropanzo 1998: 486-493). Thus the articulations of Des, Sera and Ria are suggestive of emotional burn-out given the difficult environment at schools.

b) Increased Workloads¹⁴ with Corrosive and Collaborative Cultures

This section explores the impact of increased workloads on migrant teachers in SA. The effects of an increased workload due to various post-apartheid education policies such as the introduction of a new curriculum (C2005 with outcomes based education in 1998) and the Norms and Standards for Educators (2000) coupled with a lack of appreciation of teachers' professional inputs at SA schools paved the way for teachers' decisions to migrate.

Les stated that teachers are overworked and underpaid. He said (pre-migrant interview, 07-08-03): *Our class size has increased from 25/30 to 50¹⁵. Our workload has increased from 80 to 100%, our stress levels have increased proportionately but our salary hasn't.*

Les (pre-migrant interview, 07-08-03) added that there is an absence of gratitude by management. This view has been advanced in previous studies on school environments (Darling-Hammond 1989). Les emphasized:

the importance of appreciation and thank you: This school has a record of 8 teachers that have died since 1977 when it opened. You are just a number (persal), we are dispensable objects. On the day you die you are spoken about at the funeral, then you're history.

It is evident from the above that Les felt despondent. He stated that management (at the ex-HOD school) had a tendency to want to perpetuate ignorance amongst level-one teachers (by not allowing access to the teachers' handbook¹⁶) as a means of controlling them, as was apparent during apartheid. It was this control that teachers resented. As teachers are professionals, their independence should be ensured yet they were subject to control in various ways. Les added (pre-migrant interview, 07-08-03):

We're not empowered, 95% of the teachers don't know their rights. The handbook was in the principal's office. Pre-1994 everything was hidden e.g. labour rights, now it's still hidden. They don't want people to be empowered. In lay man's terms 'they want to treat us like lighties'.¹⁷ It's all about oppression and suppression. And it's unique to ex HOD schools: they want to prove a point to their superiors.

Farida (pre-migrant interview, 18-07-03) shared his sentiments. To her school life was stressful and there was no pleasant atmosphere within which she could achieve. There does not appear to be a transformational agenda at the school where everyone 'transcends their own self interest for the progress of the organisation' (Allen 1998):

Here it is claustrophobic to work - everyone at school has their own personal agenda. If they are not going for a promotion then they won't do anything, for example fundraising. It's frustrating to be in such a school environment where there's so much red tape, the governing body and the political environment. There are too many chiefs and not enough Indians¹⁸. Managers are so superior. They have between 2/3 free periods per day for administrative work - which is ridiculous. We teach 5 periods out of 5 on most days. The days where we have one free period it is taken away for relief. As workers we are pressurized. We are like worker bees all the time and they want to be the queen.

Other teachers were also concerned about the excessive workload. Ravin (pre-migrant interview, 26-07-03) felt that there was no consultation when teachers were given duties to perform and this is indicative of undemocratic management at school (Gultig and Butler 1997). He underwent a knee operation and although he was on sick leave, he was asked to assist the substitute teacher. When he returned on a full time basis the principal did not enquire about his health nor was he welcomed back to school which connotes a lack of pastoral care which is supposed to be a key role function of principals in their engagement with staff. Ravin stated that his principal expressed joy that he and a colleague were leaving. He was of the opinion that his principal always looked at them as troublemakers for questioning certain contentious decisions made at school. It was good riddance that they were leaving. He recalled being informed of the school's decision to embark on a project: *I was asked to view how the system*

operates at another school, as it is technical (and he is the technology teacher). Then automatically the decision was taken without my involvement that I must be in charge - nobody asked me! The same applied to the sound system at the school. *Because I know how to connect it, I must be the first one at any school function and the last to leave. In the UK you get paid for any extra duty that you do.*

Post-migrants were concerned about the school management's lack of professionalism¹⁹. Teachers who attested to poor leadership and management styles expressed their inability to continue working in an environment where the principal continually treated them unprofessionally with an authoritarian leadership style. The principal generally adopted a superior attitude based on his/her senior status which highlights his transactional style of leadership as opposed to attempting to follow a transformational leadership style which is called for in education policy documents such as the White Papers (1995; 1996). They (Ben, Shree, Vern, Mersan) were subject to being belittled in private, chastised openly in the presence of other members of staff or simply ignored as if they did not exist as teachers within the school. Various reasons were provided for the principal's leadership and management style and lack of pastoral care (a role function according to the Norms and Standards for Educators 2000). Migrant teachers were adamant that the principal's inability to communicate with staff using a transformational approach undermined their professional competence and eroded emotional confidence to the extent that exiting the teaching fraternity in SA was the only option. The articulations of these teachers, highlighting their forced migration, are shared below.

Ben had been a teacher for 13 years at Tregenner High (ex-HOD school). He felt frustrated with the principal's attitude to the general running of the school (post-migrant interview, 06-06-02). Discipline²⁰ had deteriorated, there were hardly any sporting activities for pupils and the principal hardly spent a complete day at school. The principal was not interested in addressing any major issue and had a closed-door policy when he was present at school. Ben stated that if there was a problem you could not approach him. These are clearly not the qualities of a transformational leader as spoused by Sindraj (2007). Ben took unpaid leave from school to travel to the UK

to scout for a teaching job. He was offered a job but was dissatisfied with conditions at the school and decided to return to Tregenner High. Upon his return, the principal informed him that he was under investigation by the DoE who were querying his 10 days leave of absence: *Somebody brunted²¹ me and I know it's him. I could not go on in an environment of distrust, so I resigned.*

Ben saw himself as being victimized yet ethically he had erred. He was searching for a trial period in a new teaching environment whilst still in the employ of the DoE. The Employment of Educator's Act 76 of 1998 (section C-17) states "no educator shall perform or undertake to perform remunerative work outside the educator's official duty/ work". Due to the DoE investigation into his absence, Ben felt coerced into exiting the SA teaching fraternity permanently. When questioned about his goals, Ben stated that from the UK he would like to migrate to Canada as it is also a country in need of teachers and thereafter (in 10-12 years) return to SA.

Shree (post-migrant interview, 20-08-03) was also compelled into resigning²². She said that the principal (ex-HOD school) was wonderful prior to him being promoted. Thereafter it became a *nightmare to be at school*. Shree suffers from a rare blood disorder and is constantly on medication. However, as her medication affects her driving, she waits until she arrives at school before taking any medication. Her school principal threatened to fire the maid at school if she continued to make a cup of tea for Shree upon taking her pills. Shree recalled another incident when she was ill and came to school late. Her principal picked up the telephone to call the district manager²³ to complain that she was late. She felt that at no point was there any pastoral care and concern shown as the principal failed to enquire about her health but rather reprimanded her.

Vern (post-migrant interview, 23-08-03) and Mersan (post-migrant interview, 06-12-02) were teachers at the same ex-HOD school and both left because of the principal's attitude to the staff. Mersan was part of a crisis committee set up by the staff in an attempt to get the DoE to intervene and address the principal's leadership style. Mersan stated that the DoE representative failed to investigate the complaints of the staff after promising to do so. He added that life became so unbearable at school that he became suicidal. It was at this juncture that he decided to quit the profession in SA. Vern followed soon after as he

realized that there was no progress at the school since his friend's exit. Vern and Mersan's experiences in SA point to teachers' sense of powerlessness without any recourse for change, regardless of their attempts, thus compelling them to leave SA.

Mersan (e-mail, 08-12-2001) sent the following spoof e-mail to his friends and colleagues in KZN subsequent to his departure reminiscing and recalling poignant times spent together. The stress on fun and sun capture the enjoyment of the SA Indian lifestyle and the favoured hobby of fishing in Durban (a coastal town) with friends. The inclusion of the word 'sun' highlights the climate in Durban and the general lack of sunlight in the UK. 'It's hard to waai (colloquial term for leave)' indicates that the decision to leave SA was not easy. There exists the suggestion of a residual feeling of 'good times having passed on after migrating' to the UK:

Curry in the Sun

(Sung to the tune of: Seasons in the Sun).

*Goodbye to you my Indian friend
We jigged (caught) Mullet since we were 9 or 10
Together we climbed Mango trees
Ate samoosas and chillies (Indian cuisine).*

Chorus

*We caught Shad we had fun
We had curry in the sun, and the veggies that we sold
Were only just two seasons old.
Goodbye Govender it's hard to die
With all the Mynahs flying in the sky
All the incense in the air, little lighties (children) everywhere
When I see them I despair.
Goodbye Moodley, please pray for me
I was the albino of the family
You tried to teach me to eat rice, but too much
curry paste and spice (typical Indian food),
really didn't taste so nice.*

Chorus

*We caught Shad (fish) we had fun
We had curry in the sun
Please check out my cab (car) for rust, before I turn to dust.
Goodbye Naidoo it's hard to waai (leave)*

*Please don't fret or moan and cry, when there's
sardine on the run (coastal beaching of fish
along KZN in Winter)
Catching Garrick just for fun
Spotting spirits (drinking alcoholic beverages)
in the sun
We sold apples we sold plums,
We got hiding on our bums
Then Bobby he got drunk and the fishing boat
got sunk.*

Chorus

*We caught Shad we had fun
We had curry in the sun
Have you told the Larnie (rich man) yet?
Don't forget my jackpot bet (gambling on
horses).
Moodley please will you sell my cart
I can't trust Bobby cause he's not so smart
And my mother is too old, if it's left it won't get
sold
And she really needs the gold.*

Rena was also an ex-HOD teacher. She had taught for ten years prior to migration and had a masters degree (MA) in Education. She was adamant that management at her SA school did not have the interests of their teachers at heart (pre-migrant interview, 06-08-02). As she did not have any children of her own she threw herself into providing the best co-curricular trips for pupils. Sadly, she felt disappointed by her principal's behaviour when the SGB took her and a few colleagues to task over an excursion that was marred by a group of students who had gained access to alcohol. Rena was sad that attempts to reprimand the said pupils was absent, yet the principal and SGB were intent on pursuing and punishing the teachers whom students had accused of verbal abuse. To Rena this was the last straw in a series of events wherein she felt that no value was being placed on her professional abilities. Rena felt that she and the principal were professionals yet he failed to pledge his allegiance to his staff and display transformational leadership.

Rena (pre-migrant interview, 06-08-02) was of the opinion that a vital role function of the principal, which is pastoral care, was lacking. She failed to understand that a principal could request a motivation letter on why she required a door to her classroom. She stressed that the importance

of a good working relationship with colleagues and administration is essential for one's peace of mind. She added that professional output was being compromised in her SA school. She was looking for a positive change in her working environment (a healthy work environment). Rena's professional and emotional identities were of paramount importance to her and by exiting SA she was escaping the winter of her discontent.

By contrast and much to their relief and delight migrant teachers experienced supportive management coupled with pastoral care once they commenced teaching in UK schools. An examination of their experiences in the UK, which led to positive professional and emotional identities follows below. The definitions of professional and emotional identities are adapted from Jansen (2003). Teachers' professional identities entail an understanding of their ability to implement policies and classroom practices. Teachers' emotional identity encapsulates an understanding of their abilities with regard to emotional demands such as stress.

Once in the UK post-migrants (n=30) vouched for a positive change that was evident in the management of their schools. The post-migrant questionnaire asked teachers to rate the management of the UK school as either poor, average, good or excellent (Table 1) in comparison to South Africa by considering the following categories: relationship between teachers and management, appreciation and support of staff and creation of opportunities for professional growth²⁴.

Table 1: Post-migrant views of UK school management

<i>Rating</i>	<i>Frequency</i>	<i>Percent</i>
Poor	3	10.0
Average	10	33.3
Good	12	40.0
Excellent	5	16.7
Total	30	100.0

The majority of post-migrants viewed school management in the UK positively. A mere ten percent of respondents saw their school management as poor. Post-migrant Ben explained during his interview (06-06-02, UK) the extent of management support in UK schools. He stated that the norm is for the Head of Department to prepare all worksheets and tests and schemes of work. Ben's responsibility as teacher was to

simply 'administer' them. Vern (post-migrant interview, 23-08-03) said that the appreciation that management demonstrated to teachers was profound. He recalled that his principal acknowledged every effort put in by individual teachers by either praising them, sending a thank you card and sometimes even a box of chocolates.

A post-migrant (questionnaire) stated that her principal was so overcome by the standard of her work and her commitment that she was asked to return to SA on an all-expenses-paid-trip to recruit SA teachers of her calibre. She revealed that her intention on her trip to SA was to recruit teachers for the following term in her school (September 2003). This is not an unusual occurrence as Mersan revealed that he had recruited Ben to teach at his school after being approached by his principal. For teachers such behaviour had a positive effect on their self-efficacy in the UK. As Bandura (1997) has asserted, a teachers' efficacy is cognitive. Thus a sense of appreciation for teachers' efforts has the potential to affect beliefs about their abilities to perform as professionals in addition to strengthening their emotional identities.

Return-migrants also attested to a supportive management at schools in the UK (interviews, Rennie 20-08-03, Suraida 19-08-03, SA). The management at school was seen as extremely accommodating. Rennie (return-migrant interview, 20-08-03) revealed that if you were going to be absent, the procedure is to inform management so that a supply teacher can be arranged for the day. He added that there is no prying into reasons as *all you do is fill out a form and state that you have a personal reason for not attending school then you can go to Paris for the day*. He highlights the level of professionalism at UK schools but he fails to behave honestly. He also indirectly reveals that the norm in many DoE schools (in SA) is to interrogate teachers who request leave. This suspicious attitude of senior management is understandable if teachers are behaving without integrity as alluded to earlier in the section on leave regulations (4.3.1 i a.)

Suraida (return-migrant interview, 19-08-03) was overwhelmed by the warmth of management at both the schools (in the UK) where she had taught. She was treated as an equal and not made to feel inferior in her position as a level one teacher. The following excerpt illustrates this point: *the head teacher is a human being - no Mr., Ms or Mrs. It's on a first name basis (in the*

UK) as status is not important - a teacher's commitment is. Rennie (return-migrant interview 20-08-03) concurred in comparing leadership and management styles in SA to that of the UK: *Principals, especially Indian principals (in SA) want to be in charge of everything. In the UK there is no fear of the Head of Department or principal and nobody takes advantage. Everyone is straight forward, even the subject advisor. Everything is relaxed - there's no pressure*. Deva (return-migrant interview 28-08-03) succinctly summed it up as: *The support in schools is unparalleled, be it with your HOD or other members of staff - you can't even begin to compare it with SA*. Deva's final phrase (*you can't even begin to compare it with SA*) is a severe indictment by migrant teachers on ex-HOD schools in SA.

All post-migrants interviewed revealed that their experiences of teaching in the UK contributed positively to their professional growth and development. Professional growth began from the day of their arrival at school with induction courses to orientate teachers to a new curriculum. There was ongoing development in the form of inservice training (INSET) days and workshops/courses at regular intervals. Ash (post-migrant interview, 12-04-02, UK) drew a comparison between her growth in the UK and the absence of professional growth in SA: *I've learnt. I've really grown. The bonus is that the DoE in SA would not have made you grow. Here its courses upon courses. I've done 30 courses in one year. I've really networked*. She had thus far assisted to structure the RE (Religious Education) syllabus. She said that this took place over a weekend and she was accommodated at a hotel. Ash commented: *Back home you're just a persal number*. The comments of migrant teachers who had been employed at ex-HOD schools revealed the impact of their interactions with DoE representatives' (senior management e.g. principal) in such schools. This was in contrast to the collaborative cultures of many UK schools, where management affirmed and enhanced migrant teachers' professional and emotional identities.

CONCLUDING COMMENTS

The introduction of educational reforms in SA (e.g. the use of OBE in the new curriculum) affected teachers' thinking, making them believe

that the expert was external and not within. This was amplified by the need for teachers to have their work affirmed. This need to feel appreciated and rewarded manifested itself in migrants seeking gratification: financial or otherwise. The drive for a positive professional identity was more pronounced amongst experienced teachers from ex-HOD schools in their decision to leave SA. Teachers' dissatisfaction with their careers in SA, especially the nature of the school environment, impacted on their personal and professional identities. Earlier work by Hargreaves (1994) supported the view that teachers' relationships with their colleagues (and whether they work in teams) had a direct correlation to their level of commitment, enthusiasm and morale. It was apparent that pre-migrants in SA lacked the zeal to teach and displayed poor morale due to specific cultures at school. Stifling interpersonal relationships between level one teachers and management was the norm at many ex-HOD schools in KZN.

School management and not leadership has recently been targeted by the Continuing Professional Development sector in the Faculty of Education at the University of Kwa-Zulu Natal which has identified a need for workshops in this area. Fifty five School managers emerged from a successful pilot programme for school principals. It is apparent that there is a need for workshops/seminars for leaders in acting or management positions (especially in respect of pastoral care) at ex-HOD schools to create an harmonious school atmosphere and an appreciation of the input of all staff. On a holistic level, South Africa has borrowed its school management model from Britain and should therefore follow suit in terms of support. In Britain, James and Vince (2001: 307) contend that "when schools were given greater autonomy and exposed to market pressure, leadership and its development became a priority in national education policy ... induction programmes for newly appointed Heads of Department were instituted to provide a framework for their competencies". Integral to this was managers' leadership capabilities in fostering a positive school ethos. Evans (2001:302) states that the "ability of managers to buffer their staff against potentially demoralizing, demotivating externally imposed changes" was targeted. Mercer and Evans (1991) have suggested that educational leadership does have the capacity to develop and maintain contentment in professional environ-

ments. They reveal that managers' failure to address issues of morale, satisfaction and motivation represents a form of 'professional myopia' (Mercer and Evans 1991:297). Thus there is a strong possibility that leaders in schools (especially at ex-HOD schools) need to be taught skills and attitudes to nurture healthy working environments at the level of the educational institution.

Can the above findings be symptomatic of leadership and management problems in other schools? Ultimately, the school environment and leadership within schools have been key components in determining the status of teaching within a country. If the status of teaching is to be enhanced in SA, it is necessary to probe the existing culture and ethos at schools and a critical step in that direction will be to engage in more studies that examine the nature of the school environment and the role of leaders and management in schools that have not desegregated, to any great extent, in other provinces of South Africa.

NOTES

- 1 Schools were segregated along racial lines during apartheid. HOD schools were schools for pupils who were of Indian descent. By contrast House of Assembly (HOA) schools were for Whites, House of Representatives (HOR) schools were for Coloureds and Department of Education and Training (DET) schools for Africans. Democratic SA heralded the division of schools into 2 categories: public schools subsidized partially by the state and private schools. Public schools opened their doors to all races post apartheid.
- 2 Democratic SA heralded 19 education departments being collapsed into one national department and nine provincial departments.
- 3 Post apartheid SA has schools divided into 2 categories: public schools (open to all children in the immediate area and based on socio-economic categories, schools are targeted for funding on a sliding scale with poor schools receiving the highest subsidy. Learners may also be exempt from school fees based on financial need.) and independent/private schools (intake of children from any area but subject to payment of school fees , determined by the board, which is generally higher than at public schools.
- 4 Level one teachers are the lowest rank of permanent teachers in public schools.
- 5 Prior to 2000, the roles of teachers varied across racially divided education departments and were not openly discussed and monitored amongst teachers at the level of the school especially from 1990-2000. Teachers in South Africa are required to fulfil 7 roles according to the post apartheid education curriculum (C2005) introduced from 1998 until 2010:

- learning mediator; interpreter and designer of learning programmes and materials; leader, administrator and manager; scholar, researcher and lifelong learner; community, citizenship and pastoral role; assessor; and learning area/subject/discipline/phase specialist.
- 6 In the context of this paper empower means prepare.
 - 7 Transactional leadership encompasses various rewards and punishments to motivate members belonging to an organization. This form of leadership places emphasis on management's authority and is thus not the preferred mode of leadership in South Africa's attempt to democratize education at all levels. Transformational Leadership is where leaders use their charisma to 'inspire followers to transcend their own self-interest for the good of the organisation' (Allen 1998). Dollak (2008:02) is of the view that this form of leadership is 'effective in trying circumstances where members need to be guided to a promising future.'
 - 8 In SA in 2004, a teacher with 10 years experience and a professional qualification earns a set salary of approximately R12 000 per month whilst the same teacher in the UK would earn up to R25 000- R30 000 depending on whether he/she opted to take on extra duties at school.
 - 9 Soon to be qualified teachers in their final year of study, sometimes referred to as newly qualified graduates
 - 10 The South African schools Act 84 of 1996 heralded the emergence school governing bodies. A large component of the SGB is the inclusion of parents who now have a significant role in the school through teacher employment and promotions .
 - 11 Culture as meaning a way of life
 - 12 Failure in negotiations on salaries including pay progression led to strike action by teacher unions on the 2 and 16 of September 2004. Government re-negotiated with unions and the result was a 6.2% increase plus 1% for pay progression, to be implemented in October 2004. This materialized much later.
 - 13 A dance held in order to fundraise for the school where each participant contributes money that he/she has raised. These funds can be used to assist schools to pay their monthly accounts as SA public schools are now accountable for their own finances and have to therefore function as businesses.
 - 14 Refer to endnote 4. In addition to new teacher-pupil ratios, C2005 and OBE has led to greater administration, designing of learning programmes and assessments for teachers in comparison to their previous workloads under apartheid education. On the 6 June 2010, the Minister of Basic Education announced the removal of C2005 and OBE which she stated would alleviate many of the administrative and associated burdens imposed upon teachers by the post apartheid curriculum (eTV News, 19h00, 06/07/2010).
 - 15 The key source of funding for public schools emanates from the allocation of provincially subsidized teacher posts with formula determined pupil-teacher ratios which vary on the basis of pupil enrolment in the various learning areas (each with a separate weighting).
 - 16 At present the South African Council for Educators has ensured that all teachers now have their own personal copy of the education legislations governing teachers.
 - 17 A colloquial term for children
 - 18 This line implies that there are many leaders and few followers.
 - 19 The definition of professionalism in this paper draws from Sahu (2009:01) who explains that it involves 'the behavior, skill, qualities, special conventions, forms of politeness etc. associated with a certain profession/ shown by a professional.'
 - 20 Discipline here is understood as the system of rules, punishments and behavioural strategies which are needed to regulate learners and maintain order in schools (Gaustad 1992).
 - 21 colloquial term for passing information
 - 22 Another member of staff at this school resigned during this period and was recruited to teach in the UK
 - 23 Senior authority in charge of schools within a region in SA
 - 24 Bush and West-Burnham (1994:285-286) state that professional development links the 2 related concepts of 'expanding theory and improving practice'. Hence professional development encompasses a teacher gaining the knowledge and skills required for professional practice and that the acquisition of both should be more directly related than in the past to problems faced by teachers.
 - 25 a unique identification number issued to each teacher

REFERENCES

- AFT 2009. Importing Educators: Causes and Consequences of International Teacher Recruitment. Washington: American Federation of Teachers (AFT).
- Balkaran Nirmala 2007. *Teacher Desegregation in KwaZulu-Natal: A Spatial Analysis*. D.Ed Thesis, Unpublished. Durban: University of KwaZulu-Natal-Edgewood Campus.
- Bandura A 1977. Self-Efficacy: Toward a Unifying Theory of Behavioural Change. *Psychological Review*, 84: 191-215.
- Bond J T, Galinsky E, Swanberg JE 1998. The 1997 National Study of the Changing Workforce. *Report No. W98-01*, New York: Families and Work Institute.
- Bush T, Oduro G 2006. New principals in Africa: preparation, induction and practice. *Journal of Educational Administration*, 44(4): 359-75.
- Commonwealth Secretariat 2010. Council Meeting on Teacher Mobility and Migration. *Paper presented at hearings on the Mobility and Migration of Teachers*. Stoke Rochford Hall, Grantham, UK, June 22 to 24, 2010.
- Cox PL 2001. Transformational leadership: A Success Story at Cornell University. Proceedings of the ATEM/aappa 2001 Conference. From <<http://www.any.edu/facilities/atem-aappa/fullpapers/coxkeynote.html>> (Retrieved March 02, 2010)
- Darling-Hammond L 1989. *Accountability for Professional Practice*. Washington DC: Teachers College
- de Villiers R, Book S 2009. Recruiting Teachers Online:

- Marketing Strategies and Information dissemination practices of UK based Agencies. *Educational Review*, 61(3): 315-325.
- EU 2006. Achieving the Organisational Change and Technological Innovation needed for Citizen-Centric Government and Public Services: Exploring Concepts, Strategies and Practical Approaches. *Workshop* held at Marriot Hotel, Warsaw, November 7 to 8, 2006. From <<http://www.ccegov.eu>> (Retrieved on March 02, 2010)
- Evans L 2001. Delving Deeper into Morale, Job Satisfaction and Motivation among Education Professionals. *Educational Management and Administration*, 29(3): 301-306.
- Gaustad J 1992. Discipline. *Eric Digest*. From <www.ericdigest.org/1992-1/school.htm> (Retrieved June 08, 2010)
- Gultig J, Butler D 1997. *Creating People-centered Schools, Organization and Change in South Africa*. London: Oxford University Press.
- Hargreaves A 1994. *Changing Teachers, Changing Times- Teachers Work and Culture in the Post modern Age*. London: Cassell.
- Jacklin H 2001. Teachers' Identities and Space . In: M Adendorf, J Gultig, M Mason (Eds.): *Being a Teacher: Professional Challenges*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, pp. 24-37
- James C, Vince R 2001. Developing the Leadership Capability of Headteachers. *Educational Management and Administration*, 29(3): 307-317.
- Jansen JD 2003. Image-ing Teachers: Policy Images and Teacher Identity in South African Classrooms. In: K Lewin, M Samuels, Y Sayed (Eds.): *Changing Patterns of Teacher Education in South Africa*. Johannesburg: Heineman, pp.118-129.
- Manik Sadhana 2005. *Trials, Tribulations and Triumphs of Transnational Teachers: Teacher Migration between South Africa and the United Kingdom*. D.Ed thesis, Unpublished. Durban: University of KwaZulu-Natal Edgewood College.
- Manik S 2010. Transnational Teacher Migration Trends in the context of South Africa:
- Perspectives on Gender and Race. *Paper presented to The Commonwealth Secretariat's Council on Teacher Mobility and Migration at Stoke Rochford Hall, Grantham*, June 22 to 24, 2010.
- Mc Lennan A 1995. Exploring the Dynamics of Educational Change. In: P Fitz Gerald, A Mc Lennan, B Munslow (Eds.) *Managing Sustainable Development in South Africa*. Cape Town: Oxford University Press, pp.523-537.
- Mercer D, Evans B 1991. Professional Myopia: Job Satisfaction and the Management of Teachers. *School Organisation*, 11(3): 291-301.
- Mestry R, Pillay J, Du Plessis P 2006. The Role of Leaders in Shaping School Culture. From <<http://www.nmmu.ac.za/easakenton2006/article%20leaders%20influence%20in%20shaping%20school%20culture%202doc>> (Retrieved March 02, 2010)
- Moletsane R 1999. Beyond Desegregation: Multicultural Education in South African Schools. *Perspectives in Education*, 18(2): 31-42
- Mulvaney G 2005. Marketing ethics: The Recruitment of South African Teachers by British Teacher Recruitment Agencies. Johannesburg: Institute of Marketing.
- November I, Alexander G, van Wyk MM 2010. Do Principal-Educators have the ability to transform schools? A South African Perspective. *Teaching and Teacher Education*. 26(4): 786-795.
- Nurse K 2004. Diaspora, Migration and Development in the Caribbean. *Canadian Foundation for the Americas (FOCAL) policy paper FPP-04-6*. From <www.focal.ca> (Retrieved February 16, 2010)
- Sahu R 2009. Professionalism. *Yemen Times*. August 12, 2009. From <www.yementimes.com> (Retrieved June 08, 2010)
- Saltzstein A, Yuan Ting L, Hall Saltzstein G 2001. Work-family Balance and Job satisfaction: The Impact of Family Friendly Policies on Attitudes of Federal Government Employees. *Public Administration Review*, 61(4): 452-467.
- Sindhraj Pradeep 2007. *An Overview Of Leadership and Management in Primary Schools after A Decade of Democracy*. MA in Education Thesis, Unpublished. Durban: University of Kwa Zulu-Natal-Edgewood Campus.
- The Department of Education 1995. Education and Training in a Democratic South Africa: First Steps to Develop a New System. *White Paper on Education and Training*, Pretoria: Government Printers.
- The Department of Education 1996. *South African Schools Act 84 of 1996*, Pretoria: Government Printers
- The Department of Education 1996. Changing Management to Managing Change in Education. Report of the Task Team on Education Management Development, Pretoria: Government Printers
- The Department of Education 1996. Education White Paper: *The Organisation, Governance and Funding of Schools No. 16987*, Pretoria: Government Printers.
- Van der Westhuizen PC 2002. *Schools as Organizations*. Pretoria: Van Schaik.
- Varuhas J, Fursman L, Jacobsen V 2003. Work and Family Balance: An Economic View. *New Zealand Treasury Working Paper 03/26*. New Zealand Treasury.
- Weber E 2005. New Controls and Accountability for SA teachers and Schools: The Integrated Quality Management System. *Perspectives in Education*, 23(2): 63-71.
- Wright TA, Cropanzo R 1998. Emotional Exhaustion as a Predictor of Job Performance and Voluntary Turnover. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 83(3): 486-493.
- Zembylas M 2002. Structures in Feeling in Curriculum and Teaching: Theorising the Emotional Rules. *Education Theory*, 52(2): 187-208.